Disposition of Comments
on
ISO/IEC FCD 18024-4

Table of Contents

Recommendation

The editing meeting recommends unanimously that ISO/IEC 18024-4 progress to FDIS.

Japan

The national body of Japan disapproves FCD 18024-4 (SEDRIS language binding to C) for reason as below. Acceptance of these reasons and appropriate changes in the text will change our vote to approval.

JAPAN_T001) This document should be changed according to the changes in FCD 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

<u>**United Kingdom**</u>

UK National Body Comments on

SEDRIS Binding to C

Final Committee Draft ISO/IEC 18024-4

(ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 24 N2593)

(ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 24 WG 8 N0365)

The UK votes to APPROVE FCD 18024-4, subject to the following comments being satisfied.

General

UK_G001:
Entire document
The functionality should be updated to conform to the FDIS text of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

UK_G002:
Copyright notice
The copyright notice frame should be formatted to use only a single line of text.

RESPONSE: Accept.

UK_G003:
Throughout
References to "ISO/IEC 18023-1" should be references to Part 1 of "ISO/IEC 18023".

RESPONSE: The reference will be to "Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023".

UK_G004:
Throughout
All "table of contents" tables at the beginning of the clauses and annex should be renamed "Topics" as ISO standards may only have one optional overall table of contents.

RESPONSE: Accept.

UK_G005:
Throughout
All references to "this International Standard" should be references to "this part of ISO/IEC 18024".

RESPONSE: Accept.

UK_G006:

Throughout
The hyperlinks at the bottom of each HTML page actually link to ISO/IEC 18023-2. They should all be changed to the appropriate link.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Technical

4—Tables

UK_T001:
Table 4.5
Either Table 4.4 is missing, or this table should be renumbered as Table 4.4.

RESPONSE: The tables will be sequentially numbered.

5—Definition of fundamental data types

UK_T002:

Table 5.1
This table should be layout out in two columns for ease of navigation.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Annex A-- Data types in compilation order and external functions

UK_T003:
Throughout
The technical contents of this annex should be compiled successfully before the submission of FDIS text.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Editorial

5—Definition of fundamental data types

UK_E001:
5.1.2
The reference to "The SEDRIS standard, ISO/IEC 18023-1" should be changed to "Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023".

RESPONSE: Accept.

UK_E002:
5.2
The mismatch between the table of contents numbering and the numbering of the subclauses should be corrected.

RESPONSE: Accept.

United States

US National Body Comments on ISO/IEC FCD 18024-4, Information technology - Synthetic Environment Data Representation and Interchange Specification (SEDRIS) - Language bindings - Part 4: C

The US votes to approve ISO/IEC FCD 18024-4, Information technology - Synthetic Environment Data Representation and Interchange Specification (SEDRIS) - Language bindings - Part 4: C with the following comments:

GENERAL

US_G001:

At the beginning of all clauses after Clause 2, the "table of contents" should be called "Topics"

RESPONSE: Accept.

TECHNICAL

Clause 3

US_T001:

Sub Clause 3.7 Identifiers for graphical items

Problem: Are the new items those introduced by registration? If so should be made clearer.

Recommendation: This clause should be rewritten. In as much as the registration of new selection item data types will also register a label.

RESPONSE: Accept.

EDITORIAL

index.html

US_E001:

index.html

the 1st sentence cites an incorrect "full title" for the standard. Change "— *C*" to read "— *Part 4: C*". The full title is shown correctly at the top of the Scope clause.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E002:

index.html

In the table of contents, clause 5 is titled "Type definitions", however the actual title is shown in clause 5 as "Definition of fundamental data types". Correct where appropriate for consistency.

RESPONSE: The index will use the Clause 5 title.

US_E003:

index.html

the last paragraph states that "There are several annexes included in this International Standard", however there is only one annex provided.

RESPONSE: The text will be corrected to be: "The following annex is included in this part of ISO/IEC 18024:".

Introduction

US_E004:

Introduction

In the 2nd sentence, change "application programmer interface" to read "application program interface", as per clause 7 of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 1

US_E005:

Clause 1 Scope

Verify whether the "1 Scope" heading should be centered on the page, as are the headings of all other clauses.

RESPONSE: The "1 Scope" heading will be left-justified. The title of the standard will remain centred.

US_E006:

Clause 1 Scope

In the 1st sentence, change "application programmer interface" to read "application program interface", as per clause 7 of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 2

US_E007:
Clause 2. Normative references
For I18041-4, change "— *C*" to read "— *Part 4: C*", as per the Scope clause of
ISO/IEC 18041-4.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E008:
Clause 2. Normative references
For I18042-4, change "— *C*" to read "— *Part 4: C*", as per the Scope clause of
ISO/IEC 18042-4.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 3

US_E009:
Clause 3
In the footnote for this clause, spell out the NGA acronym, and provide a hyperlink to
the NGA web site for additional information.

RESPONSE: Accept. NGA will be expanded to "National Geospatial-Intelligence
Agency".

US_E010:
Clause 3 Abbreviation table.
The word "color" is spelled using US English and should be spelled using
international English.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E011:
Sub Clause 3.2
In the 1st sentence, change "application programmer interface" to read "application
program interface", as per clause 7 of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E012:
Sub Clause 3.9
The first sentence references 5 Type definitions, however the actual title is shown in clause
5 as "Definition of fundamental data types". Correct where appropriate for consistency.

RESPONSE: The reference to clause 5 will use the clause 5 name.

US_E013:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 3rd paragraph, 2nd sentence, change "… a pointer to a pointer to the structure
which defines …" to read either "… a pointer to a pointer to the structure, which
defines …" (add a comma) or "… a pointer to a pointer to the structure that defines
…" (change "which" to read "that").

RESPONSE: The word "which" will be changed to "that".

US_E014:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 4th paragraph, 1st sentence, change "… to a subsequent function which returns …" to read either "… to a subsequent function, which returns …" (add a comma) or "… to a subsequent function that returns …" (change "which" to read "that").

RESPONSE: The word "which" will be changed to "that".

US_E015:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 4th paragraph, 4th sentence, change "… pointers which may have …" to read either "… pointers, which may have …" (add a comma) or "… pointers that may have …" (change "which" to read "that").

RESPONSE: The word "which" will be changed to "that".

US_E016:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 5th paragraph, 1st sentence, the hyperlink to 3.11.3 C-specific SEDRIS status codes is inoperative.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E017:
Sub Clause 3.10.2
In the 5th paragraph, 3rd sentence, change "Whenever, an error occurs …" to read "Whenever an error occurs …" (delete the comma).

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E018:
Sub Clause 3.11.1
In the 2nd sentence, change "Errors status values …" to read "Error status values …" (make "Errors" singular).

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 4

US_E019:
Sub Clause 4.2.1
In the 2nd paragraph, subparagraphs a and b end in semicolons (;), whereas subparagraphs c – f end in periods (.). Correct the punctuation as appropriate.

RESPONSE: All items except the last will end in a semi-colon. The last item (f) will be merged into the preceding items as appropriate.

US_E020:

Sub Clause 4.2.1
Abbreviation policy in construction of identifiers, 2nd item c

"refinements are" should be "refinement is"

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E021:
Sub Clause 4.2.2
The grammar rules for using the words "which" vs. "that" are: "X, which Y" or "X that Y". Accordingly, in all 3 sentences, change "which" to read "that".

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E022:
Table 4.2 -- The font size of the abbreviations appearing in the Abbreviation column are too small to read. Enlarge the font size used.

RESPONSE: The font size will be allowed to be no smaller than 90% of the normal size.

US_E023:
Sub Clause 4.3.2
In the first sentence, provide a hyperlink to ISO/IEC 18023-1 Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The reference will be corrected.

US_E024:
Sub Clause 4.3.3
In the first sentence, provide a hyperlink to ISO/IEC 18023-1 Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The reference will be corrected.

Clause 5

US_E025:
Clause 5.
Definition of fundamental data types -- Verify whether the "5. Definition of fundamental data types" heading should be centered on the page, as are the headings of all other clauses.

RESPONSE: The heading will be left-justified.

US_E026:
Sub Clause 5.1.2
In the first sentence, provide a hyperlink to ISO/IEC 18023-1 Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The reference will be corrected.

US_E027:
Sub Clause 5.2
For all occurrences for Selection data types replace "# define" with "# define & nbsp;"

RESPONSE: The text "#define " will be used.

US_E028:
Sub Clause 5.2.2
There are 2 subclauses that are assigned this subclause number; "Integer data

types" and "Floating point data types". Change the 2nd occurrence to read "5.2.3 Floating point data types", and renumber all subsequent 5.2.x subclauses.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E029:
Sub Clause 5.2.5
Selection data types -- In the 1st sentence, use the Courier font for "SE_Short_Integer" for emphasis.

RESPONSE: SE_Short_Integer will be formatted in code style.

US_E030:
Sub Clause 5.2.6
Set data types -- In the 1st sentence, use the Courier font for "SE_Integer" for emphasis.

RESPONSE: SE_Integer will be formatted in code style.

US_E031:
Sub Clause 5.3.2
In the 2nd sentence, use the Courier font for "SE_Float" for emphasis.

RESPONSE: SE_Float will be formatted in code style.

US _E032:
Sub Clause 5.3.2
Next to last sentence, change "… array types which are required …" to read "… array types that are required …".

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E033:
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 1st paragraph, last sentence, change "… the first index is referred is called the length …" to read "… the first index is called the length …" (delete the phrase "referred is").

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E034:
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 2nd paragraph, change "… the structures which form …" to read "… the structures that form …".

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E035:
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 2nd paragraph, something appears to be missing from the end of the 2nd sentence. It appears to end prematurely as: The suffix is of form ".

RESPONSE: The form should be "'_nD" where n is the dimensionality of the array.'

US_E036:
Sub Clause 5.3.3
In the 3rd paragraph, change "… types which are required …" to read "… types that are required …".

RESPONSE: Accept. Also, change "of data type fields" to "or data type fields"

Clause 6

US_E037:
Sub Clause 6.1.2
There is a hyperlink to <u>Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023</u>. Other references to Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023 in this standard appear as merely <u>ISO/IEC 18023-1</u>. Correct for consistency.

RESPONSE: Accept.

US_E038:
Sub Clause 6.2
Clarify the meaning of the sentence "The following functions <u>provide comprise</u> the SEDRIS application program interface." (see the underlined words). The word "provide" should be removed.

RESPONSE: See response to SEDRIS_T020.

SEDRIS

SEDRIS Organization Comments

On

Final Committee DRAFT ISO/IEC 18024-4

18 December 2004

GENERAL

SEDRIS_G001: Index

The title of the Index file should be changed from "EDCS frames test" to "ISO/IEC 18024-4—SEDRIS Binding to C"

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G002: Throughout
Replace "application programmer interface" with "application program interface" (see Introduction and 1 Scope).

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G003: Throughout

The word SEDRIS should be removed from all phrases such as "SEDRIS transmittal", "SEDRIS API", etc., except in 1 Scope.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G004: Each file

The titles used in each file except the scope should be made consistent.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G005: Throughout

The tables of content at the beginning of each clause and annex should be called "Topics".

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G006: Throughout

References to this specification should all be changed to "this part of ISO/IEC 18024".

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G007: Throughout

The entire document should be made consistent with the next draft of ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_G008: Throughout

The titles of the various clauses and/or annexes are inconstantly layed out. They should either be all centered or all left-justified.

RESPONSE: The clause titles will all be left-justified.

TECHNICAL

Index

SEDRIS_T001: full title

"C" should be "Part 4: C".

RESPONSE: Accept.

Foreword

SEDRIS_T002: Boilerplate text

The text should be updated to the latest form required by ITTF.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Introduction

SEDRIS_T003: 1st paragraph

The text should be aligned with the phraseology used in ISO/IEC 18023-1.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 2

SEDRIS_T004: Hyperlinks

The hyperlinks should be applied to the organization name and/or title as required by ITTF.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 3

SEDRIS_T005: 3.2 Conformance, 2nd paragraph

The references to EDCS and SRM should be to the standards.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T006: 3.3, 3rd sentence

The text "replace the error handling function" should be "replace functions that correspond to the function data types".

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T007: 3.7, heading

The name should be changed to "Identifiers for registered items".

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T008: 3.7, 1st paragraph, 2nd sentence

The phrase "These data types" should be "Registration".

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T009: 3.7, 1st paragraph, 3rd sentence

This sentence should be replaced by "These new values are referenced by identifiers specified as part of the registration."

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T010: **3.7, 1ˢᵗ paragraph, 4ᵗʰ sentence**

This text should be removed as it does not apply to registered items in SEDRIS.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T011: **3.7, 2ⁿᵈ paragraph**

So that unregistered items can be easily recognized, this paragraph should be changed to:

"The format of the identifiers for new values of selection and set date type values is:

"SE_datatypeprefix_Un"

where:

datatypeprefix is the set of characters used for normative value names of this data type.
"U" indicates unregistered.
n is the absolute value of the item number to be used for the unregistered value."

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T012: **3.7, Example**

The example should only show an example for an unregistered image mapping method.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T013: **3.8**

The following text should be appended: "The function data types define functions that return other data types."

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T014: **3.10.2, 5ᵗʰ paragraph**

The reference should be to 3.11.2.

RESPONSE: Accept and the hyperlink will be repaired.

SEDRIS_T015: **3.11.1**

The data type "SE_StatusCode" should be "SE_Return_Code".

Add the following additional text after the first sentence: "Further information about a FAILURE return is provided by using the function SE_GetLastFunctionStatus which returns a value of type SE_Status_Code."

In the last sentence, "Errors status values defined in ISO/IEC 18023-1 (see I18023-1])" should be "SE_Status_Code" value defined in part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023-1"

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T016: **3.11.2, Table 3.2**

The table should also include the codes for the selectors. Also, the heading for the 1st column should be changed to "Selector".

RESPONSE: Accept. Also, a new column will be added after the 1st column which adds the code of the selector.

Clause 4

SEDRIS_T017: Table 4.4

Either Table 4.5 should be numbered toTable 4.4, or there is a missing table.

RESPONSE: The tables will be sequentially numbered.

Clause 5

SEDRIS_T018: Title

The title of this clause is different from that specified in the Index. The title should be consistent throughout.

RESPONSE: The index will be corrected to use the title of Clause 5.

Clause 6

SEDRIS_T019: 6.1.2, template

The portion of the template displaying comments should be removed as no functions specifications have comments. Also, the last paragraph should be removed.

RESPONSE: Accept.

SEDRIS_T020: 6.2, 1st sentence

This sentence make so sense. It should be replaced by "The following functions comprise the API.".

RESPONSE: Accept.

EDITORIAL

Index

SEDRIS_E001: List of annexes

"Compilation order" should be the text shown in the table.

RESPONSE: Accept.

Clause 4

SEDRIS_E002: 4.1.1

The reference to ISO/IEC 18023-1 should be hyperlinked to Clause 2.

RESPONSE: The text "ISO/IEC 18023-1" will be changed to "Part 1 of ISO/IEC 18023" and hyperlinked to the appropriate entry in Clause 2.